



# South Coast Air Quality Management District

21865 Copley Drive, Diamond Bar, CA 91765-4178  
(909) 396-2000 • [www.aqmd.gov](http://www.aqmd.gov)

## ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ADVISORY GROUP FRIDAY, JANUARY 27, 2012 MEETING MINUTES

### MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dr. Joseph Lyou, AQMD Governing Board Member, EJAG Chairman  
Rhetta Alexander, San Fernando Valley Interfaith Council  
Lawrence Beeson, Loma Linda University, School of Public Health  
Paul Choe, Korean Drycleaners & Laundry Association  
Afif El-Hasan, American Lung Association  
Mary Figueroa, Riverside Community College  
Maria Elena Kennedy, Quail Valley Task Force  
Evelyn Knight, Long Beach Economic Development Commission  
Brenda LaMothe, S. Los Angeles Service Representative for L.A. Mayor  
Angelo Logan, East Yard Communities for Environmental Justice  
Daniel Morales, National Alliance for Human Rights

### MEMBERS ABSENT:

Detrich Allen, City of Los Angeles  
Suzanne Bilodeau, Knott's Berry Farm  
Alycia Enciso, Small Business Owner  
Mimi Holt, SEIU Local 121 Registered Nurses  
Andrea Hricko, Southern California Environmental Health Sciences  
Pat Kennedy, Greater Long Beach Interfaith Community  
Margaret Mapes, St. Joseph Center  
Elina Nasser, Center for Occupational and Environmental Health, UCLA  
William Nelson, OC Signature Properties  
Salvador Ramirez, National Hispanic Environmental Council  
Woodie Rucker-Hughes, NAACP – Riverside Branch  
John Moretta, Resurrection Church  
Neal Richman, Breathe LA  
Rafael Yanez, Member of the Public

### OTHERS PRESENT:

Earl Elrod, Board Member Assistant (*Yates*)  
Mark Abramowitz, Board Member Assistant (*Lyou*)  
Darcy Wheelles, CEA/AAR  
Jennifer Sarnecki, SCAG  
Kimberly Clark, SCAG  
Frank Wen, SCAG  
Tom Gross, Southern California Edison  
Greg Adams, Los Angeles County Sanitations District

**AQMD STAFF:**

Anupom Ganguli, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
John Olvera, Principal Deputy District Counsel  
Jill Whynot, Assistant Deputy Executive Officer  
Lisa Tanaka O'Malley, Community Relations Manager  
Sam Atwood, Media Office Manager  
Philip Fine, Planning & Rules Manager  
Jean Ospital, Health Effects Officer  
Ian MacMillan, Program Supervisor  
Nicole Soto, Secretary

**Agenda Item #1 - Call to Order/Opening Remarks**

Chair Dr. Joseph Lyou called the meeting to order at 12:06 PM.

Chair Lyou noted Governor Brown appointed Mr. Arsenio Mataka as new Assistant Secretary for Environmental Justice at California Environmental Protection Agency (CalEPA). Mr. Angelo Logan asked if Mr. Mataka was with another agency prior to being appointed. Chair Lyou responded he was previously with a planning agency, an attorney at California Rural Legal Assistance (CRLA), and also interned with the City of Los Angeles.

Chair Lyou informed EJAG members that under the California Health and Safety Code, there is a requirement for the advisory group to appoint a member to the 2012 Air Quality Management Plan (AQMP) Advisory Council. Chair Lyou explained that members could not take action on the item since it was not on the Agenda, but a special meeting would possibly be conducted, and a quorum of the group would be needed.

Chair Lyou reminded members to complete the Ethics Training course, as it is required every two years for advisory group members.

**Agenda Item #2 – Approval of October 28, 2011 Meeting Minutes**

Chair Lyou called for the approval of the meeting minutes. The October 28, 2011 meeting minutes were approved.

**Agenda Item #3 – Member Updates**

Mr. Logan reminded members that comments are due February 1, 2012 for of the proposed Burlington Northern Santa Fe (BNSF) Southern California International Gateway (SCIG), which will place a railyard on the Port of Long Beach's (POLB) property. Mr. Logan also noted the draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR) is expected to be released on April 1, 2012.

Chair Lyou announced the Intermodal Container Transfer Facility (ICTF) EIR is expected to be released soon.

Mr. Logan encouraged members to engage in the Gateway Cities Council of Governments (COG) Air Quality Action Plan that is underway.

Ms. Brenda LaMothe noted the Metro Crenshaw Line EIR would also be released soon.

Dr. Anupom Ganguli encouraged members to look at the Senate version of Moving Ahead for Progress in the 21st Century (MAP-21) federal transportation bill, which contains a number of air quality provisions related to transportation projects.

Dr. Ganguli noted that the Gateway Cities COG, San Gabriel Valley COG, and Congresswoman Grace Napolitano held a roundtable discussion with Union Pacific. Dr. Lyou said the process is going to continue and he encourages those involved to participate.

#### **Agenda Item #4 – Draft 2011 Environmental Justice Advisory Group Accomplishments**

Chair Lyou asked if there were any comments to the 2011 EJAG Accomplishments. The 2011 EJAG Accomplishments were approved.

#### **Agenda Item #5 – Overview of the Regional Transportation Plan**

Ms. Jennifer Sarnecki and Ms. Kimberly Clark of Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) provided an overview of the 2012 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP) and Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS).

Chair Lyou asked if SCAG looked at MATES III when reporting on environmental justice emissions data. Ms. Clark responded they did not and Chair Lyou suggested they include it because there are large gaps with environmental justice and localized toxics issues, for which MATES III is the best resource.

Chair Lyou asked if the projected Hispanic population would be over fifty percent, which Ms. Clark confirmed. Ms. Brenda LaMothe asked if this was from the USC study, and Ms. Clark replied the 2000 and the 2005-2009 data is from the U.S. Census and the 2035 data is from SCAG's Integrated Growth Forecast.

Mr. Logan asked about the relevance of the percentage of job accessibility by ethnicity. Ms. Clark said it is relevant to how much accessibility improves from SCAG's baseline plan. Mr. Logan asked what the baseline plan reflected, and Ms. Clark replied that the baseline plan reflects no change, as if SCAG is able to meet the far reaching projects in the plan.

Dr. Lawrence Beeson asked what the units were for Particulate Matter (PM) in the 2035 projections of PM emissions within the 500 foot freeway buffer zone. Ms. Clark responded she would have to check. Dr. Beeson responded it would be useful to include the units on the slide. Mr. Logan asked if the emissions were tailpipe emissions, and Ms. Clark responded that they were total emissions.

Chair Lyou asked where the data was acquired for the map showing the Inland Empire and downtown Los Angeles as having the highest cancer risk versus the Ports. Ms. Clark said the data was from Manuel Pastor at USC. Chair Lyou asked why the data is distinctly different from MATES III and asked Dr. Jean Ospital why they are seeing lower numbers. Dr. Ospital said he isn't sure what Manuel Pastor used, but it possibly could be national data. Dr. Ospital said it probably includes diesel risk levels. Dr. Ganguli noted it may be the EPA diesel risk versus the California diesel risk.

Chair Lyou asked if more people were purchasing cars in high quality transit areas, which Ms. Clark confirmed. Ms. Maria Kennedy asked how renters are defined and how renters in high income neighborhoods are filtered. Mr. Frank Wen of SCAG said it's a rough measure, not actual data, and said he can provide data on the different geographic areas to her.

Mr. Logan asked if the emissions analysis was completed under the assumption that the East/West corridor would be a zero emissions freight corridor. Ms. Sarnecki said yes it was. Mr. Logan noted the inclusion of the East/West corridor in the plan is very controversial, and said he thinks it should not be in the plan under the assumption it will be a zero emission corridor without really knowing if it will be enforceable. Mr. Logan also said he is concerned about the mitigation toolbox and how it will be enforced since it is a voluntary program, but in the EIR as a mitigation measure. Mr. Logan formally requested the comment period for the RTP be extended since it is a major plan to review and is difficult to complete in the allotted time. Ms. Sarnecki said she would notify her manager of his comments, but encouraged Mr. Logan to submit his comments in writing to SCAG.

Mr. Daniel Morales noted many of the slides showed statistics for Non-Hispanic Asians, and asked if there is a large group of Hispanic Asians. Ms. Clark replied that the U.S. Census measures for race and ethnicity are different, one indicator being if people are Hispanic or not, and if not, what the racial breakdown is for that person, which is self-described.

Ms. Mary Figueroa said the majority of information displayed on the cancer risk and respiratory hazard slides is based in the Los Angeles area. She asked if the Inland Empire is accounted for in the study because based on the slide, there are no problems in the Inland Empire. Ms. Clark said for the final report they can make the county boundaries more obvious.

Ms. Evelyn Knight asked who is responsible for coordinating the stakeholders transportation plans and proposals, accounting for the cumulative effects, what already exists, and what their process is. Ms. Sarnecki said it is the responsibility of SCAG whose role it is to conduct an EIR. Ms. Sarnecki said since the region is so large, they do a program EIR where they look at the cumulative impacts of the projects and the growth through 2035, which they've done under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Ms. Knight asked what happens next. Ms. Sarnecki said there are significant impacts as a result of the plans and growth, and since it is a large region, they include a large list of mitigation measures, which they think will mitigate the impacts, but noted those impacts can't be reduced to less than significant. Ms. Sarnecki continued to say once the plan is adopted, they will also have to adopt language that states that the impacts can't be reduced to less than significant, and are doing a Cumulative Impact Report as part of CEQA.

Chair Lyou noted that the California Air Resources Board (CARB) may have adopted clean car regulations that are going to overlap with the RTP and asked if this has been taken into consideration. Ms. Sarnecki responded they have taken into account new regulations that will impact fuel use. Chair Lyou noted he is not sure how something this significant can be included in long range plans such as the RTP. Mr. Wen explained the RTP takes into consideration future emissions, but the future can change. So, they take into consideration what they have available now and follow-up with a new analysis each year.

Mr. Greg Adams of Los Angeles County Sanitations District reiterated that the comment period for the EIR is very short for such a lengthy document. Mr. Adams asked if SCAG knows what will happen with the SCS in light of the court's decision in December to dissolve the Redevelopment Agencies (RDA). Mr. Wen said SCAG is releasing a Regional Housing Assessment within the SCS, which will be released on February 2, 2012. Mr. Wen continued to say that the housing community is looking at how local jurisdictions will urge SCAG to take leadership and address the financial needs and impact, and noted SCAG will evaluate the results as part of the General Plan update.

Dr. Afif El-Hasan said the average age of cars is 10.8 years, and asked how the age of fleet vehicles is factored in, when considering poverty and poor economy. Mr. Wen said car fleets are reflected in CARB's statistical analysis. The percentage of households without a car has declined significantly, but there is a trend for people to want to own a car, so in the SCS they are trying to make urban transportation more accessible. Chair Lyou added SCAG mostly relies on models by the CARB, which are updated every two years.

#### **Agenda Item #6 – Results from an Air Monitoring Study in Boyle Heights**

Dr. Philip Fine presented the results from an air monitoring study conducted in Boyle Heights at Resurrection Catholic School.

Chair Lyou said the error bars for the PM2.5 results are quite large and Dr. Fine explained they are not error bars, they are the standard deviation, which show the distribution of measurements. Chair Lyou asked if a statistical analysis was done to see if there were any significant differences. Dr. Fine said these would not be significant differences.

Mr. Adams asked about the 1.8 multiplier for elemental carbon. Dr. Fine replied it is the measure of the elemental carbon content of diesel PM.

Dr. Ganguli asked Dr. Fine to explain the difference between black and elemental carbon. Dr. Fine explained they are different measurements, black carbon is a measurement of the blackness of the filter, and elemental carbon is a chemical measurement. Chair Lyou asked why the truck flow peaks after black carbon. Dr. Fine responded they are not sure why, but it could be a combination of meteorology and traffic volume. Chair Lyou asked if meteorology meant wind. Dr. Fine replied that, in this context, it means stagnation, or the lack of wind.

Mr. Logan asked how the three air monitoring sites differ from the Hudson Elementary School site. Dr. Fine said they don't like to compare samplings that weren't conducted at the exact same time due to changes in meteorology and the air getting cleaner, but noted from previous results at Hudson, there were higher concentrations of diesel than at Resurrection. Ms. Knight asked how high the diesel concentration was at Hudson. Dr. Fine said it's difficult to make a direct comparison, but that the results vary during certain months and proximity to the Terminal Island freeway. Ms. Knight asked if Hudson shows some of the highest results in the region, which Dr. Fine replied some of the highest numbers were seen near Hudson.

Mr. Logan asked where the Central Los Angeles site is located. Dr. Fine responded it is north of Union Station at the Department of Water and Power facility near the railroad tracks. Mr. Logan asked how the Resurrection PM2.5 collection method is different from the other two sites. Dr. Fine said they used a special sampler that measures PM2.5 mass and has a different flow rate and slightly different configuration. Dr. Fine continued to explain the method is used when additional detail is needed, speciation of PM2.5, and that the method consistently comes out 5-15% higher. Dr. Fine noted this method has been used in various studies including MATES, and it was used at Resurrection because they were unable to pull samplers from other sites. Mr. Logan asked if elemental carbon is only measured in PM2.5. Dr. Fine said for Resurrection they only measured in PM2.5. Mr. Logan asked if PM10 is more accurate than PM2.5 in measuring close proximity. Dr. Fine replied it's not more accurate, but explained if next to a roadway, PM10 mass would show more of a roadway impact than PM2.5. Mr. Logan asked about elemental carbon. Dr. Fine said there wouldn't necessarily be any elemental carbon, although there is some in tire dust and on the roadways, but not as much as is emitted directly from tail pipes. Mr. Logan asked if the prevailing winds from Exide would blow towards

Commerce. Dr. Fine replied they generally blow east or northeast. Mr. Logan asked if formaldehyde is a natural product of vehicle emissions. Dr. Fine explained it has a wide variety of sources such as combustion, tail pipe emissions, industrial emissions, and it can be formed in the atmosphere as a chemical reaction of other gases.

Mr. Logan asked if there have been advancements with measuring nuisance odors from rendering plants. Dr. Fine said since it is very difficult to quantify odors, complaints should be called into the District's complaint line so that inspectors can identify the odors under the nuisance regulations.

Chair Lyou asked if there is pre and post data for the Clean Trucks, Ports, and Goods Movement programs. Dr. Fine responded that the best collection of data is directly from the Ports themselves, and said it has shown a significant reduction in elemental carbon. Chair Lyou asked if there is a rough percentage of how much. Dr. Fine explained there are still questions with the emissions inventory versus elemental carbon, so he doesn't want to presuppose which is correct. Ms. Knight asked what the range of the change is for PM10. Dr. Fine said MATES IV will be the best measurement, but it is probably around 30-40% lower from the peak in 2007.

#### **Agenda Item #7 – Update on Phase I of the Environmental Railyard Research Impacting Community Health (ENRRICH) Study**

Dr. Beeson provided an update on Phase I of the Environmental Railyard Research Impacting Community Health (ENRRICH) Study.

Mr. Logan asked what the expected number of cancer risk is based off. Dr. Beeson said it's based off the Desert Sierra Cancer Surveillance Program, San Bernardino, Riverside, Inyo, and Mono Counties.

Ms. Rhetta Alexandar asked, besides lack of money, what other reasons there were for people without health insurance. Dr. Beeson explained people tend not to have insurance when they are unemployed or they may be employed but the amount of income for the household is not sufficient to cover health care.

Mr. Logan asked if in Phase II of the health survey they plan to look at the Health Risk Assessment (HRA) CARB completed near the San Bernardino Railyards, so they can expand beyond cancer risk and look at health risk. Dr. Beeson said they are looking at self-reported symptoms, so they plan to look at many health outcomes. Mr. Logan asked if they plan to compare their data with the HRA and said it seems more relevant to look at other health impacts. Dr. Beeson responded they look at a variety of outcomes, that non-cancer respiratory diseases is one of the major categories and they will also be looking at how noise is strongly related to various health effects.

Chair Lyou asked if they considered using different medicines related to diseases as data. Dr. Beeson said when someone self-reports asthma, they will ask to see their inhalers. Chair Lyou asked if they considered doing a regression of the study based on distance to the railyards. Dr. Beeson said they can easily use Geographic Information System (GIS) to do that. Chair Lyou asked if social psychology can play a role when self-reported factors are being measured. Dr. Beeson said they are aware of misclassification on self-reporting and if they have enough money within the grant to sample medical records they will investigate it later. Mr. Beeson noted in other research being done at the School of Public Health, they take random samples of self-reported issues and validate the symptoms in their medical records. Ms. Jill Whynot said it would be useful to analyze factors such as smoking and occupation. Dr. Beeson said those questions are included in the survey.

**Agenda Item #8 – Overview of American Lung Association’s (ALA) Report in the Costs of Air Pollution**

This item has been placed on the April Agenda.

**Agenda Item #9 – Other Business**

No comments.

**Agenda Item #10 – Public Comment**

No comments.

**Agenda Item #11 – Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 3:05 PM.